

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR  
THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF OKLAHOMA**

<b>STATE OF OKLAHOMA,</b>	)	
	)	
<b>Plaintiff,</b>	)	
	)	
<b>v.</b>	)	<b>No. 05-CV-329-GKF(SAJ)</b>
	)	
<b>TYSON FOODS, INC., et al.,</b>	)	
	)	
<b>Defendants.</b>	)	

**STATE OF OKLAHOMA'S MOTION TO STAY THE  
JANUARY 16, 2008 OPINION AND ORDER [DKT #1463]  
PENDING A RULING ON THE STATE'S OBJECTIONS**

Plaintiff, the State of Oklahoma, ex rel. W.A. Drew Edmondson, in his capacity as Attorney General of the State of Oklahoma and Oklahoma Secretary of the Environment C. Miles Tolbert, in his capacity as the Trustee for Natural Resources for the State of Oklahoma ("the State"), respectfully requests that the January 16, 2008 Opinion and Order [DKT #1463] be stayed pending a ruling on the State's Objections. In support of its Motion, the State states as follows:

1. On January 16, 2008, Magistrate Judge Joyner entered an Order (1) holding, contrary to the weight of authority, that the state law of attorney-client privilege applies in a case such as this one involving federal question jurisdiction, (2) requiring the State to revise its privilege logs in such a fashion that would, as a practical matter, require the revelation of information itself privileged or protected, and (3) holding that Peterson Farms had established a "special need" for documents for which the State has claimed work product protection, while not only making no provision for an individualized document-by-document showing of "substantial need" for the State's fact work product, but also making no provision for protection against disclosure of the State's opinion work product.

2. The State timely moved for reconsideration of the Order on the ground that the Order was clearly erroneous and contrary to law. *See* DKT #1486.

3. Magistrate Judge Joyner denied reconsideration. *See* DKT #1629.

4. The State has now timely filed Objections to the Order. *See* DKT # 1659.

5. While Magistrate Judge Joyner's Reconsideration Order extended the compliance deadlines under the Order from March 7, 2008 to April 4, 2008, *see* DKT #1629, this new deadline is prior to the completion of the briefing cycle on the State's Objections. *See* LCvR 7.2(e).

6. Because this Order would require the disclosure of privileged and protected information prior to a resolution of the State's Objections, the State now moves to stay the Order [DKT #1463] pending a ruling on these Objections.

7. As explained in *United States v. Rx Depot, Inc.*, 297 F.Supp.2d 1306, 1308 (N.D. Okla. 2003):

When considering a stay pending appeal, the Court must address the following factors: (1) the likelihood of success on appeal; (2) the threat of irreparable harm if the stay is not granted; (3) the absence of harm to opposing parties if the stay is granted; and (4) any risk of harm to the public interest. "With respect to the four stay factors, where the moving party has established that the three 'harm' factors tip decidedly in its favor, the 'probability of success' requirement is somewhat relaxed."

(Citations omitted.)

8. For the reasons set forth in its Objections, *see* DKT # 1659, the State submits it has a strong likelihood of success on appeal.

9. With respect to the threat of irreparable harm if the stay is not granted, the D.C. Circuit has stated: "the general injury caused by the breach of the attorney-client privilege and the harm resulting from the disclosure of privileged documents to an adverse party is clear

enough." *United States v. Philip Morris, Inc.*, 314 F.3d 612, 622 (D.C. Cir. 2003) (granting stay pending appeal); *see also In re Qwest Communications International, Inc.*, 450 F.3d 1179, 1183 (10th Cir. 2006) ("In *Barclaysamerican*, this court held that '[i]n most cases disclosure makes meaningful review impossible because after disclosure whatever privilege attaches would be worthless.' 746 F.2d at 655 (quotations omitted)") (mandamus action); *Haines v. Liggett Group, Inc.*, 975 F.2d 81, 97 (3d Cir. 1992) ("Because of the sensitivity surrounding the attorney-client privilege, care must be taken that, following any determination that an exception applies, the matters covered by the exception be kept under seal or appropriate court-imposed privacy procedures until all avenues of appeal are exhausted") (mandamus action). Given that there is no way to effectively unring the bell once disclosure of its privileged and protected information has occurred, the State will plainly suffer irreparable injury if disclosure of this information is required prior to exhaustion of its appellate rights.

10. With respect to the absence of harm to opposing parties if the stay is granted, "[a] mere assertion of delay does not constitute substantial harm." *See Philip Morris, Inc.*, 314 F.3d at 622. Under the present Amended Scheduling Order, discovery does not end until March 2, 2009. *See* DKT # 1659. Accordingly, Peterson Farms will suffer no prejudice if the Order is stayed while the State pursues its Objections.

10. Finally, with respect to the risk of harm to the public interest, it is clear that "the attorney-client privilege is an 'institutionally significant status or relationship' with deep roots in our nation's adversary system. As such, the privilege advances 'broader public interests in the observance of law and administration of justice.'" *See Philip Morris, Inc.*, 314 F.3d at 622 (citations omitted); *see also In re Grand Jury Subpoenas*, 144 F.3d 653, 659 (10th Cir. 1998) ("The importance and sanctity of the attorney-client privilege is well established"). Allowing the

State to defend its claims of attorney-client privilege and work product protection serves these public interests.<sup>1</sup>

11. Plainly, the State has established that the three "harm" factors tip decidedly in its favor. Additionally, the State, in its Objections, has established a strong "probability of success" (even though under the circumstances here the requirement is somewhat relaxed). Accordingly, the stay should issue.

12. The State has conferred with counsel for Peterson Farms on this matter. Peterson Farms objects to a stay of the January 16, 2008 Opinion and Order [DKT #1463] pending a ruling on the State's Objections.

WHEREFORE, premises considered, the State's Motion should be granted.

Respectfully Submitted,

W.A. Drew Edmondson OBA # 2628  
ATTORNEY GENERAL  
Kelly H. Burch OBA #17067  
J. Trevor Hammons OBA #20234  
Tina Lynn Izadi OBA #17978  
Daniel P. Lennington OBA #21577  
ASSISTANT ATTORNEYS GENERAL  
State of Oklahoma  
313 N.E. 21<sup>st</sup> St.  
Oklahoma City, OK 73105  
(405) 521-3921

---

<sup>1</sup> Indeed, whether the state law of attorney-client privilege or the federal law of attorney-client privilege applies in cases involving federal question jurisdiction, whether privilege logs that would, as a practical matter, require the revelation of information itself privileged or protected can be required, whether a party can be required to turn over fact work product where there has been no individualized document-by-document showing of "substantial need" for the State's fact work product, and whether a party can be required to disclose opinion work product are all issues of considerable public interest.

s/Robert A. Nance

M. David Riggs OBA #7583  
Joseph P. Lennart OBA #5371  
Richard T. Garren OBA #3253  
Douglas A. Wilson OBA #13128  
Sharon K. Weaver OBA #19010  
David P. Page OBA #6852  
Robert A. Nance OBA #6581  
D. Sharon Gentry OBA #15641  
RIGGS, ABNEY, NEAL, TURPEN,  
ORBISON & LEWIS  
502 West Sixth Street  
Tulsa, OK 74119  
(918) 587-3161

Louis W. Bullock OBA #1305  
Robert M. Blackmore OBA #18656  
BULLOCK BULLOCK & BLAKEMORE  
110 West Seventh Street Suite 707  
Tulsa OK 74119-1031  
(918) 584-2001

Frederick C. Baker  
(admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Lee M. Heath  
(admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Elizabeth C. Ward  
(admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Elizabeth Claire Xidis  
(admitted *pro hac vice*)  
MOTLEY RICE, LLC  
28 Bridgeside Boulevard  
Mount Pleasant, SC 29465  
(843) 216-9280

William H. Narwold  
(admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Ingrid L. Moll  
(admitted *pro hac vice*)  
MOTLEY RICE, LLC  
20 Church Street, 17<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Hartford, CT 06103  
(860) 882-1676

Jonathan D. Orent  
(admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Michael G. Rousseau  
(admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Fidelma L. Fitzpatrick  
(admitted *pro hac vice*)  
MOTLEY RICE, LLC  
321 South Main Street  
Providence, RI 02940  
(401) 457-7700

Attorneys for the State of Oklahoma

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on this 27<sup>th</sup> day of March, 2008, I electronically transmitted the above and foregoing pleading to the Clerk of the Court using the ECF System for filing and a transmittal of a Notice of Electronic Filing to the following ECF registrants:

W. A. Drew Edmondson, Attorney General Fc\_docket@oag.state.ok.us  
Kelly H. Burch, Assistant Attorney General kelly\_burch@oag.state.ok.us  
J. Trevor Hammons, Assistant Attorney General trevor\_hammons@oag.state.ok.us  
Tina Lynn Izadi, Assistant Attorney General tina\_izadi@oag.state.ok.us  
Daniel P. Lennington, Assistant Attorney General daniel.lennington@oag.ok.gov

M. David Riggs driggs@riggsabney.com  
Joseph P. Lennart jlennart@riggsabney.com  
Richard T. Garren rgarren@riggsabney.com  
Douglas A. Wilson doug\_wilson@riggsabney.com  
Sharon K. Weaver sweaver@riggsabney.com  
David Page dpage@riggsabney.com  
Robert A. Nance rnance@riggsabney.com  
D. Sharon Gentry sgentry@riggsabney.com  
RIGGS, ABNEY, NEAL, TURPEN, ORBISON & LEWIS

Louis W. Bullock lbullock@bullock-blakemore.com  
Robert M. Blakemore rblakemore@bullock-blakemore.com  
BULLOCK BULLOCK & BLAKEMORE

Frederick C. Baker fbaker@motleyrice.com  
Lee M. Heath lheath@motleyrice.com  
Elizabeth C. Ward lward@motleyrice.com  
Elizabeth Claire Xidis cxidis@motleyrice.com  
William H. Narwold bnarwold@motleyrice.com  
Ingrid L. Moll imoll@motleyrice.com  
Jonathan D. Orent jorent@motleyrice.com

Michael G. Rousseau  
Fidelma L. Fitzpatrick  
MOTLEY RICE, LLC  
**Counsel for State of Oklahoma**

mrousseau@motleyrice.com  
ffitzpatrick@motleyrice.com

Robert P. Redemann  
Lawrence W. Zeringue  
David C. Senger  
PERRINE, MCGIVERN, REDEMANN, REID, BARRY & TAYLOR, P.L.L.C.

rredemann@pmrlaw.net  
lzingue@pmrlaw.net  
dsenger@pmrlaw.net

Robert E Sanders  
Edwin Stephen Williams  
YOUNG WILLIAMS P.A.

rsanders@youngwilliams.com  
steve.williams@youngwilliams.com

**Counsel for Cal-Maine Farms, Inc and Cal-Maine Foods, Inc.**

John H. Tucker  
Theresa Noble Hill  
Colin Hampton Tucker  
Leslie Jane Southerland  
RHODES, HIERONYMUS, JONES, TUCKER & GABLE

jtucker@rhodesokla.com  
thill@rhodesokla.com  
ctucker@rhodesokla.com  
ljsoutherland@rhodesokla.com

Terry Wayen West  
THE WEST LAW FIRM

terry@thewestlawfirm.com

Delmar R. Ehrich  
Bruce Jones  
Dara D. Mann  
Krisann C. Kleibacker Lee  
Todd P. Walker  
FAEGRE & BENSON, LLP

dehrich@faegre.com  
bjones@faegre.com  
dmann@faegre.com  
kklee@faegre.com  
twalker@faegre.com

**Counsel for Cargill, Inc. & Cargill Turkey Production, LLC**

James Martin Graves  
Gary V Weeks  
Paul E. Thompson, Jr  
Woody Bassett  
Jennifer E. Lloyd  
BASSETT LAW FIRM

jgraves@bassettlawfirm.com  
gweeks@bassettlawfirm.com  
pthompson@bassettlawfirm.com  
wbassett@bassettlawfirm.com  
jlloyd@bassettlawfirm.com

George W. Owens  
Randall E. Rose  
OWENS LAW FIRM, P.C.

gwo@owenslawfirm.com  
rer@owenslawfirm.com

**Counsel for George's Inc. & George's Farms, Inc.**

A. Scott McDaniel smcdaniel@mhla-law.com  
Nicole Longwell nlongwell@mhla-law.com  
Philip Hixon phixon@mhla-law.com  
Craig A. Merkes cmerkes@mhla-law.com  
MCDANIEL, HIXON, LONGWELL & ACORD, PLLC

Sherry P. Bartley sbartley@mwsqw.com  
MITCHELL, WILLIAMS, SELIG, GATES & WOODYARD, PLLC  
**Counsel for Peterson Farms, Inc.**

John Elrod jelrod@cwlaw.com  
Vicki Bronson vbronson@cwlaw.com  
P. Joshua Wisley jwisley@cwlaw.com  
Bruce W. Freeman bfreeman@cwlaw.com  
D. Richard Funk rfunk@cwlaw.com  
CONNER & WINTERS, LLP  
**Counsel for Simmons Foods, Inc.**

Stephen L. Jantzen sjantzen@ryanwhaley.com  
Paula M. Buchwald pbuchwald@ryanwhaley.com  
Patrick M. Ryan pryant@ryanwhaley.com  
RYAN, WHALEY, COLDIRON & SHANDY, P.C.

Mark D. Hopson mhopson@sidley.com  
Jay Thomas Jorgensen jjorgensen@sidley.com  
Timothy K. Webster twebster@sidley.com  
Thomas C. Green tcgreen@sidley.com  
Gordon D. Todd gtodd@sidley.com  
SIDLEY, AUSTIN, BROWN & WOOD LLP

Robert W. George robert.george@kutakrock.com  
Michael R. Bond michael.bond@kutakrock.com  
Erin W. Thompson erin.thompson@kutakrock.com  
KUTAK ROCK, LLP  
**Counsel for Tyson Foods, Inc., Tyson Poultry, Inc., Tyson Chicken, Inc., & Cobb-Vantress, Inc.**

R. Thomas Lay rtl@kiralaw.com  
KERR, IRVINE, RHODES & ABLES

Jennifer Stockton Griffin jgriffin@lathropgage.com  
David Gregory Brown

LATHROP & GAGE LC  
**Counsel for Willow Brook Foods, Inc.**

Robin S Conrad  
NATIONAL CHAMBER LITIGATION CENTER  
rconrad@uschamber.com

Gary S Chilton  
HOLLADAY, CHILTON AND DEGIUSTI, PLLC  
**Counsel for US Chamber of Commerce and American Tort Reform Association**  
gchilton@hcdattorneys.com

D. Kenyon Williams, Jr.  
Michael D. Graves  
Hall, Estill, Hardwick, Gable, Golden & Nelson  
**Counsel for Poultry Growers/Interested Parties/ Poultry Partners, Inc.**  
kwilliams@hallestill.com  
mgraves@hallestill.com

Richard Ford  
LeAnne Burnett  
richard.ford@crowedunlevy.com  
leanne.burnett@crowedunlevy.com

Crowe & Dunlevy  
**Counsel for Oklahoma Farm Bureau, Inc.**

Kendra Akin Jones, Assistant Attorney General  
Charles L. Moulton, Sr Assistant Attorney General  
Jessica E. Rainey  
Barry G. Reynolds  
TITUS HILLIS REYNOLD LOVE  
DICKMAN & McCALMON  
Kendra.Jones@arkansasag.gov  
Charles.Moulton@arkansasag.gov  
jrainey@titushillis.com  
reynolds@titushillis.com

William S. Cox, III  
Nikaa Baugh Jordan  
LIGHTFOOT, FRANLIN & WHITE  
**Counsel for American Farm Bureau Federation and the National Cattlemen's Beef Association**  
wcox@lightfootlaw.com  
njordan@lightfootlaw.com

John D. Russell  
FELLERS, SNIDERS, BLAKENSHIP,  
BAILEY & TIPPENS, P.C.  
jrussell@fellersnider.com

William A. Waddell, Jr.  
David E. Choate  
FRIDAY, ELDREDGE & CLARK, LLP  
**Counsel for Amicus Curiae Arkansas Farm Bureau Federation**  
waddell@fec.net  
dehoate@fec.net

Mia Vahlberg  
GABLE GOTWALS

mvahlberg@gablelaw.com

Adam J. Siegel  
James T. Banks  
HOGAN & HARTSON, LLP

ajsiegel@hhlaw.com  
jtbanks@hhlaw.com

**Counsel for National Chicken Counsel, U.S. Poultry & Egg Association and National Turkey Federation (collectively “Amici Curiae”)**

M. Richard Mullins  
MCAFEЕ & TAFT

richard.mullins@mcafeetaft.com

**Counsel for Texas Farm Bureau, Texas Cattle Feeders Association Texas Pork Producers Association and Texas Association of Dairymen**

Also on this 27<sup>th</sup> day of March, 2008, I mailed a copy of the above and foregoing pleading to the following:

**David Gregory Brown**  
Lathrop & Gage, LC  
314 E. High Street  
Jefferson City, MO 65101

**Thomas C. Green**  
Sidley Austin Brown & Wood, LLP  
1501 K St. NW  
Washington, DC 20005

**Cary Silverman**  
**Victor E. Schwartz**  
Shook Hardy & Bacon LLP  
600 14<sup>th</sup> St. NW, Ste. 800  
Washington, DC 20005-2004

**C. Miles Tolbert**  
Secretary of the Environment  
State of Oklahoma  
3800 North Classen  
Oklahoma City, OK 73118

**Gary V. Weeks**  
Bassett Law Firm  
P.O. Box 3618  
Fayetteville, AR 72702

**Dustin McDaniel**

**Justin Allen**

Office of the Attorney General (Little Rock)

323 Center Street, Suite 200

Little Rock, AR 72201-2610

s/Robert A. Nance

Robert A. Nance